RESOLUTION NO. 2022-01

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA APPROVING THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 400 EAST FOURTH STREET (HISTORIC EXTERIOR MODIFICATION APPLICATION NO. 2022-03)

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana hereby finds, determines and declares as follows:

- A. Bethany Schermer, representing The Sound ("Applicant"), is requesting approval of Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2022-03 to allow exterior modifications to the property at 400 East Fourth Street, historically known as the Hotel Finley.
- B. The legal owner of the property is the International Church of the Foursquare Gospel.
- C. The legal description for the subject property is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated by this reference as though fully set forth herein.
- D. Hotel Finley is individually listed as No. 30 on the Santa Ana Register of Historical Properties and categorized as "Contributive" in 2001.
- E. In 2001, the building was also found eligible for the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion C (Architecture) and as a contributor to a local district.
- F. The Hotel Finley was built in 1922 and contributes to "the overall character and history" of downtown Santa Ana, as part of the historic Fourth Street streetscape, and as an example of a typical multiple use downtown building from the first quarter of the 20th century. It is also a "good example of period architecture" as a demonstration of the commercial vernacular of the period that relied primarily on decorative brickwork for architectural interest. Character-defining exterior features of the building that should be preserved include, but may not be limited to: Simple massing and symmetrical façades; Flat roof with brick parapet; Glazed brick wall cladding with decorative brick detailing; Single and paired window openings with wood framing and wood mullions at second floor; Storefront window bays at street level; and Ceramic hex and mosaic tile threshold at original building entry on Fourth Street with "Finely Bldg." inscription in contrasting colored tile.

- G. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, no exterior physical modifications, other than those identified by the Historic Resources Commission for administrative approval by city staff, shall be permitted with respect to a historic structure until the Historic Resources Commission approves such request at a duly noticed public hearing and issues a certificate of appropriateness. The Historic Resources Commission shall issue the certificate of appropriateness upon finding that the proposed modification(s) does not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property.
- H. The proposed exterior modifications include modifications along the primary facades/along Fourth and French Streets, including: Existing non-original storefront windows will be removed and replaced with new aluminum storefront windows; Prismatic glass panels will be restored in the transom windows; The existing non-original cement plaster will be removed from the piers and replaced with new compatible brick veneer with a synthetic stone base; At the second floor, the existing original wood framed paired windows will be retained and restored; The existing double hung window units will be retained; The infilled windows along French Street will be restored to match the existing paired double hung windows; The existing glazed brick cladding with decorative green tiles will be retained and restored; A new compatible cornice will replace the existing cement plaster band at the location of the original cornice; New fabric awnings will be installed above the storefront window; and New compatible signage will be added to the building.

Within the interior, the existing stairs will be removed and replaced with two new stairs that will access to the roof, and the elevator will be enlarged to provide ADA-compliant access to the new roof deck. The penthouse structures for the stairs and elevator will be located on the roof, and would be finished with cement plaster and flat roof design. Each penthouse will be 10'-11" in height above the existing parapet. The west stair and the elevator will be located at the southwest portion of the roof. The west stair will be set back from the west parapet by 22 feet and the elevator will be set back 40 feet from the west parapet. Mechanical equipment located at the southwest corner of the roof will be screened by a 5'-0" metal screen set back approximately two feet from the west parapet.

The north stair will be at the central eastern portion of the roof set back 30 feet from the north parapet. The roof deck will consist of wood decking at the south and east portions of the roof. A green roof will be installed at the balance of the roof area and will be set back almost seven feet from the parapet and will be raised nearly a foot above the existing parapet. There will be a new guardrail installed at the perimeter of the roof. The guardrail will be set back seven feet from the north and west parapets to minimize visibility from the street.

I. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, the Historic Resources Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on March 3, 2022 for the request for exterior modifications to the Hotel Finley.

- J. Since the property is deemed a historic structure, all exterior modifications are required to meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - 1. The following Secretary of Interior's Standards are applicable:
 - i. The project complies with Standard No. 1. The building at 400 E. Fourth Street will be used as it was historically, it will remain a mixed-use commercial property. The original hotel use will not return to the second floor; however, retail will remain on the ground floor with offices on the second floor.
 - ii. The project complies with Standard No. 2. The proposed project will retain and preserve the historic character of the commercial building. Distinctive materials and features that characterize the building will be retained, including its rectangular plan, two-story height, flat roof, and symmetrical composition including storefront window bays and second story fenestration. No character-defining features will be removed. There will be a new rooftop deck and garden with three new penthouse structures. They will be simple in design and will be a compatible addition. They will be set back sufficiently and will only be slightly visible from French Street. The new perimeter guardrail will be minimally visible from the street. No character-defining features will be removed, and the historic character of the property will be retained.
 - iii. The project complies with Standard No. 3. The project does not propose changes that create a false sense of historical development. The rooftop additions and alterations will be contemporary in style and clearly differentiated from the historic building.
 - iv. The project complies with Standard No. 4. No changes to the property have acquired significance.
 - v. The project complies with Standard No. 5. The proposed project will retain the distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques and examples of craftsmanship that characterize the building, including the white glazed brick with decorative green tiles and original wood framed windows at the second story. The rooftop additions will not disturb existing features.
 - vi. The project complies with Standard No. 6. The project will repair damaged or deteriorated historic features and replace missing features. The glazed brick will be repaired as necessary, the cement plaster piers will be replaced with compatible brick veneer; the prismatic glass will be restored in the storefront transom windows; and the missing cornice will be restored.

- vii. The project complies with Standard No. 7. The project does not propose chemical or physical treatments that might cause damage to historic materials.
- viii. The project complies with Standard No. 8. The project will include excavation for updated seismic work. If unexpected archaeological resources are found, they will be identified, protected, preserved, and/or documented in consultation with a qualified archaeologist.
- ix. The project complies with Standard No. 9. In addressing new additions to historic buildings, the Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings recommends:
 - Constructing new additions so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials and so that the character-defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.
 - Designing additional stories, when required for the new use, that are set back from the wall plane and are as inconspicuous as possible when viewed from the street.
 - Designing new additions in a manner that makes clear what is historic and what is new.

The proposed project will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new construction will be limited to the roof. The project proposes to construct new stair and elevator penthouse additions, and a new roof deck and garden so that there is the least possible loss of historic materials. The historic building's character-defining massing, symmetrical composition, flat roof, glazed brick cladding, single and paired window openings and storefront window bays will not be obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

The rooftop additions will be sufficiently set back from the primary building facades to be minimally visible from the street. The west stairway penthouse will be set back 22 feet from the French Street façade and the north stairway penthouse will be set back 30 feet from the Fourth Street façade. The five-foot screen for the mechanical equipment will be at the far south end of the French Street façade and will be visible from the street; however, it will be softened with planting material. The new 3'-8" perimeter guardrail will be set

back seven feet from the building facades and be minimally visible from the street. The project therefore will not significantly alter the appearance of the historic building as experienced along Fourth and French Streets and would maintain the existing street frontage and physical and visual relationship to the street and neighboring properties.

The proposed rooftop additions will be differentiated from the historic building by their contemporary design, simplified forms, and new finishes. The penthouse structures will be rectangular volumes finished with cement plaster and they will have flat roofs. They have been designed to recede into the background and be subordinate to the historic building and will not be confused as being original to the building.

x. The project complies with Standard No. 10. The proposed stair and elevator penthouse additions, roof deck and garden will be constrained to the roof. The historic building's essential character-defining features and overall form and massing will remain intact. If removed in the future, the additions would leave the historic building's form and integrity unimpaired.

<u>Section 2</u>. In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, the recommended action is exempt from further review under Section 15331, Class 31, as this action is designed in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Categorical Exemption, Environmental Review No. 2021-72 will be filed for this project.

<u>Section 3</u>. The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana after conducting the public hearing hereby approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2022-03, as conditioned in Exhibit B, attached hereto and incorporated herein. The Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed modifications do not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property. This decision is based upon the evidence submitted at the above said hearing, which includes, but is not limited to: the Staff Report and exhibits attached thereto and the public testimony, all of which are incorporated herein by this reference.

<u>Section 4</u>. The Historic Resources Commission Secretary is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this Resolution with the County Recorder's Office after the adoption of this Resolution pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 5029.

ADOPTED this 3rd day of March 2022.

Tim Rush

Chairperson

Vale.

FREE RECORDING PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE § 27383

APPROVED AS TO FORM: Sonia R. Carvalho, City Attorney

John M. Funk

Sr. Assistant City Attorney

AYES:

Commission members: CARPENTER, CHRISTY, HARDY,

MCLOUGHLIN, MURASHIE, PENA-SARMIENTO,

RUSH, SHIPP (8)

NOES:

Commission members:

ABSTAIN:

Commission members:

NOT PRESENT:

Commission members: FRAZIER (1)

CERTIFICATE OF ATTESTATION AND ORIGINALITY

I, CHRISTINA LEONARD, Commission Secretary, do hereby attest to and certify the attached Resolution No. 2022-01 to be the original resolution adopted by Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana on March 3, 2022.

Date:

Commission Secretary

City of Santa Ana

FREE RECORDING PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE § 27383

EXHIBIT A LEGAL DESCRIPTION

APN	Address	Legal Description	Owner Names
144-291-05	400 East Fourth Street	LOT 2 OF TRACT NO. 12812, IN THE CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AS SHOWN ON A MAP RECORDED IN BOOK 703, PAGES 47, 48 AND 49, ALL OF MISCELLANEOUS MAPS, IN THE OFFICE OF THE COUNTY RECORDER OF SAID COUNTY.	International Church of the Foursquare Gospel

EXHIBIT B

Conditions of Approval for Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA) No. 2022-03

The Applicant must comply with each and every condition listed below <u>prior to</u> exercising the rights conferred by the Historic Resource Commission's approval and the City of Santa Ana Register of Historic Properties pursuant to Section 30-6 of the Santa Ana Municipal Code. The Applicant must remain in compliance with all conditions listed below:

- Prior to final occupancy, the applicant shall install a bronze plaque honoring and recognizing the structure at 400 E. Fourth Street, historically known as the Hotel Finley building. The plaque shall include the historic name, address, year built, and local historic register designation. The final dimensions; location, text and description on the plaque shall be reviewed and approved by planning staff.
- The proposed signage shall comply with all sign requirements as listed in Division 5 (On-Premise Signs) of the SD84 (Transit Zoning Code) and with all City sign permit applications and requirements. (Added by the Historic Resources Commission on March 3, 2022)
- 3. The applicant shall work with planning staff to ensure that the proposed signage complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (the Standards). The signage shall be designed and placed to respect the size, scale, and design of the historic building. Moreover, the signage shall not obscure significant features of the historic building, damage historic materials, and the materials shall be compatible with those of the historic building. The final design, materials, and lighting for the signage shall be reviewed and approved by planning staff. (Added by the Historic Resources Commission on March 3, 2022)
- 4. The applicant shall work with planning staff to ensure that the proposed awnings comply the Standards. The awnings shall be designed and placed to be consistent with the size and style of the building. Moreover, the installation shall not damage historic materials. The final design and materials of the awnings shall be reviewed and approved by planning staff. (Added by the Historic Resources Commission on March 3, 2022)
- 5. The property owner shall ensure that the interior layout of any future tenants and/or occupants fronting Fourth or French Street does not obscure the visibility of the existing storefronts. The interior layouts shall be carefully designed to ensure that the storefront development pattern and historic

FREE RECORDING PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE § 27383

character in Downtown Santa Ana is not interrupted. (Added by the Historic Resources Commission on March 3, 2022)