

RESOLUTION NO. 2023-06

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA APPROVING THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 419 EAST WELLINGTON AVENUE (HISTORIC EXTERIOR MODIFICATION APPLICATION NO. 2023-05)

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SANTA ANA AS FOLLOWS:

**Section 1.** The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana hereby finds, determines and declares as follows:

- A. Duane Rohrbacher, Jr. and Shannon Qhihuiz (“Applicants”) are requesting approval of Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-05 to allow exterior modifications to the property at 419 East Wellington Avenue, historically known as the Titchenel-Catland House.
- B. The legal owners of the property are Duane Paul Rohrbacher, Jr., a single man and Shannon Dominique Quihuiz, a single woman as joint tenants.
- C. The legal description for the subject property is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated by this reference as though fully set forth herein.
- D. The Titchenel-Catland House is individually listed as No. 138 on the Santa Ana Register of Historical Properties and categorized as “Key” in 1997.
- E. The Titchenel-Catland House was originally built in 1887 and is architecturally significant as a Victorian Italianate Style residence. In the early to mid-1920s, the Titchenel-Catland underwent a remodel that added Craftsman Bungalow elements. These Craftsman style alterations have acquired historic significance in their own right. Character-defining exterior features of the Titchenel-Catland House that should be preserved include, but may not be limited to, the Victorian elements (elongated windows and doors, prominent bay window, wide shiplap siding trimmed with corner boards), the gable roof, single exposed beam-ends, rafter tails, and louvered vents, representative of the Craftsman Bungalow style.
- F. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, no exterior physical modifications, other than those identified by the Historic Resources Commission for administrative approval by city staff, shall be permitted with respect to a historic structure until the Historic Resources Commission approves such request at a duly noticed public hearing and issues a certificate of appropriateness. The Historic Resources Commission shall issue the certificate of appropriateness upon finding that the proposed

modification(s) does not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property.

- G. The proposed exterior modifications to the two-story, single-family residence consist of a partial rehabilitation of an existing, deteriorating front porch at the building's primary (south) façade. The porch will undergo foundation repairs and reinforcement; non-original Craftsman style porch elements that were added during the early to mid-1920s remodel will be removed and replaced by a simple, compatible porch design; compatible porch features that are in disrepair will be maintained and repaired in-kind; and conjectural architectural features that have been added over time and are not compatible with the historic property will be removed.
- H. Pursuant to Santa Ana Municipal Code Section 30-6, the Historic Resources Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on July 6, 2023, for the request for exterior modifications to the Titchenel-Catland House.
- I. Since the property is deemed a historic structure, all exterior modifications are required to meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - 1. The following Secretary of Interior's Standards are applicable:
    - i. The project complies with Standard No. 1. The property currently maintains its historic use as a single-family residence. The use is not proposed to change. The interior configuration will remain the same with minimal changes to the front porch design to address structural and safety concerns, while simultaneously removing inappropriate, non-original features.
    - ii. The project complies with Standard No. 2. The historic character of the subject property will be retained and preserved. The proposed porch rehabilitation has been designed to maintain existing, compatible porch materials and remove only non-original and conjectural features. Although the proposed rehabilitation will alter the primary (south) elevation, the existing porch is not original to the original Victorian Italianate style residence built in 1887, as it underwent a 1920s Craftsman style porch remodel and has since been altered over time. The proposed rehabilitation will provide a more compatible porch design that does not introduce new Victorian Italianate and Craftsman style elements. The proposed exterior alterations will not alter any important spatial relationships that characterize the property as the porch has been altered overtime.
    - iii. The project complies with Standard No. 3. The proposed changes will not create a false sense of historical development. The proposed rehabilitation will read as a

simplistic design in comparison to the existing Victorian Italianate and Craftsman style single-family residence. The existing, deteriorating front porch will be redesigned to include thinner porch posts with a new, third post, to provide visual symmetry to the entrance. The new porch post will contain no new ornamentation to be confused with existing original building features, and will be distinct enough to discern that it is new construction. Moreover, the project includes the removal of conjectural features, including the existing corbel at the porch's eastern terminus, the two window consoles inner brow ornamentation at the double-window of the south façade, and window lintel.

- iv. The project complies with Standard No. 4. The Craftsman style porch remodel in the 1920s removed the building's early Victorian Italianate style porch entirely and expanded the porch footprint to the building's southwest corner. The expanded porch, constructed approximately 100 years ago, has acquired historic significance in its own right as it was designed in relation with the building's overall Craftsman style alterations. However, the porch has since been altered numerous times. The porch piers, posts, and header are not appropriately sized to the residence and they are severely deteriorated. The proposed project will improve upon the 1920's remodel to be more compatible with the historic residence by introducing new porch posts with a thinner diameter and a third porch post to frame the porch entrance and provide symmetry to the building. The porch header (below the cornice) and railing will be removed to provide a cleaner design that opens the porch and creates better visibility of the residence. The existing porch skirt, which is not original and deteriorated, will be removed and replaced with a compatible skirt in a similar design as the existing. Additionally, conjectural items that have no historic significance will be removed. The project will not remove any significant features that acquired historic significance in their own right, such as the porch roof and cornice, decking, and massing.
- v. The project complies with Standard No. 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. Although the project proposes altering the front porch, the majority of items to be altered will be either repaired or replaced like-for-like given the amount of deterioration. The porch posts, which are not original and deteriorated, will be

redesigned to reflect a compatible, simple design. The porch railing, which is also not original and in disrepair, will be removed entirely. The porch header is not compatible and will be removed.

- vi. The project complies with Standard No. 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. The non-original porch posts and railing are so severely deteriorated with wood rot and missing wood pieces that it has become a structural hazard. The porch posts will be removed entirely and redesigned to reflect a compatible, simple design that better suites the historic property, which has been altered over time.

The deteriorating porch decking has holes and wood rot. It will undergo like-for-like spot repair with T6 Doug Fir wood to match the existing decking. The existing 12-inch horizontal wood band immediately above the porch skirt (at the south and west facades) is not original and does not accurately match the existing band to the east of the porch steps (pieces of wood overlap on the south façade and the band is bent and deteriorated at the west façade). The band will be fully replaced to match the existing band that is to the east of the porch steps. The porch skirt is not original and severely deteriorated. The skirt will be fully removed and replaced with a new skirt in a similar style, featuring vertical slats made out of redwood material to match existing. The new skirt slats will be two inches wider than existing and will be spaced apart to allow for airflow. Two new porch vents (which are part of the porch skirt) will be replaced like-for-like in the same locations.

A small area immediately east of the porch steps on the south façade will also receive a new horizontal band and porch skirt to cover existing exposed brick at the foundation, and continue the porch skirt design at the porch's eastern terminus. Although this design is not based on documentary evidence, the porch and entire building have been largely altered over time and the new band and skirt will provide cover to the exposed foundation while unifying the overall porch design.

- vii. The project complies with Standard No. 9. The front porch rehabilitation will not destroy historic materials or features. All

porch materials and features in need of full replacement (porch band, skirt, and posts) will be replaced with the same materials as existing, and those needing in-kind repair (porch decking) will be repaired with matching materials. The existing porch skirt is not original and therefore the new skirt will feature slightly wider posts that will be compatibly designed with the overall porch. Although the deteriorated posts and piers will be removed entirely, the new posts will replace the old in the same location (with the addition of a third new post to provide symmetry) and will provide a more compatible porch design with thinner post width to better match the residence. Important spatial relationships characterizing the Victorian Italianate and Craftsman style residence will not be disturbed, as the rehabilitation will not add or remove building or porch square footage. The new porch posts will be differentiated from the historic building in that they will not contain Victorian Italianate ornamentation or be overtly Craftsman in style, however their simplistic design will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

- viii. The project complies with Standard No. 10. The proposed project is considered generally reversible, as it is confined to the exterior porch only. It also does not remove essential aspects of the building's form and materials. Although the proposed rehabilitation will be at the primary façade, the alterations are largely focused on repairing and replacing existing materials and avoids altering the most significant and character-defining features. The essential form of the house and the vast majority of its historic materials will remain unimpaired.
- ix. Standards 7-8 are not applicable. No features of this description would be affected by this Project.

**Section 2.** In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, the recommended action is exempt from further review under Section 15331, Class 31, as this action is designed in a manner consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Based on this analysis, a Notice of Exemption, Environmental Review No. 2023-49 will be filed for this project.

**Section 3.** The Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana after conducting the public hearing hereby approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for Historic Exterior Modification Application No. 2023-05, as conditioned in Exhibit B, attached hereto and incorporated herein. The Historic Resources Commission finds that the proposed modifications do not substantially change the character and integrity of the historic property. This decision is based upon the evidence submitted at the above said

FREE RECORDING PURSUANT TO  
GOVERNMENT CODE § 27383

hearing, which includes, but is not limited to: the Staff Report and exhibits attached thereto and the public testimony, all of which are incorporated herein by this reference.

**Section 4.** The Historic Resources Commission Secretary is hereby directed to file a certified copy of this Resolution with the County Recorder's Office after the adoption of this Resolution pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 5029.

ADOPTED this 6<sup>th</sup> day of July 2023.

---

Tim Rush  
Chairperson

APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
Sonia R. Carvalho, City Attorney

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
John M. Funk  
Chief Assistant City Attorney

AYES: Commission members: Alberta Christy, Manuel J. Escamilla, Ginelle Hardy, Edwards Murashie, Tim Rush (5)

NOES: Commission members \_\_\_\_\_

ABSTAIN: Commission members \_\_\_\_\_

NOT PRESENT: Commission members: Daniel Cornelius, Irma P. Jauregui, Dwayne Shipp (3)

#### CERTIFICATE OF ATTESTATION AND ORIGINALITY

I, NUVIA OCAMPO, Commission Secretary, do hereby attest to and certify the attached Resolution No. 2023-06 to be the original resolution adopted by Historic Resources Commission of the City of Santa Ana on July 6, 2023.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Nuvia Ocampo  
Commission Secretary  
City of Santa Ana

**EXHIBIT A  
LEGAL DESCRIPTION**

<b>APN</b>	<b>Address</b>	<b>Legal Description</b>	<b>Owner Names</b>
398-028-11	419 East Wellington Avenue	REAL PROPERTY IN THE CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DESCRIBED AS FOLLOWS:  LOT 5 OF TITCHENAL'S ADDITION TO SANTA ANA, IN THE CITY OF SANTA ANA, COUNTY OF ORANGE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AS SHOWN ON A MAP RECORDED IN' BOOK 6, PAGE 49 OF MISCELLANEOUS MAPS, IN THE OFFICE OF THE COUNTY RECORDER OF SAID COUNTY.	Duane Rohrbacher, Jr. and Shannon Quihuiz



**EXHIBIT B**

**Conditions of Approval for Historic Exterior Modification Application (HEMA)  
No. 2023-05**

The Applicant must comply with each and every condition listed below prior to exercising the rights conferred by the Historic Resource Commission's approval and the City of Santa Ana Register of Historic Properties pursuant to Section 30-6 of the Santa Ana Municipal Code. The Applicant must remain in compliance with all conditions listed below:

1. The applicant shall regularly maintain all landscaping in the front yard so that the historic building and its character defining features (elongated windows and doors, prominent bay window, wide shiplap siding trimmed with corner boards), the gable roof, single exposed beam-ends, rafter tails, and louvered vents representative of the Craftsman Bungalow style) are visible from the public right-of-way.
2. Prior to building permit issuance and prior to installation, the applicant shall work with City staff to determine the exact materials and finishes to be used for the proposed work to ensure quality and compatibility.